

Let Liberty Transform Palestinians, Too

Scott Atran

► **To cite this version:**

Scott Atran. Let Liberty Transform Palestinians, Too. Christian Science Monitor, 2004.
<ijn_00000550>

HAL Id: ijn_00000550

https://jeannicod.ccsd.cnrs.fr/ijn_00000550

Submitted on 13 Nov 2004

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.


[The Monitor's View](#)
[Opinion](#)
[Letters to the Editor](#)
Columns:
[Dante Chinni](#)
[Helena Cobban](#)
[Pat M. Holt](#)
[John Hughes](#)
[Moral Dilemmas](#)
[Daniel Schorr](#)
[Jeffrey Shaffer](#)
[Godfrey Sperling](#)
Features Columns:
[2nd Chapters](#)
[Marilyn Gardner](#)
[Economic Scene](#)
[A Global Accounting](#)
[David R. Francis](#)
WEB COLUMNS
[Another View](#)
[Patrick Chisholm](#)
[Crossroads](#)
[Ghassan Rubeiz](#)
[Deep Space](#)
[Michelle Thaller](#)
[Pop Eye](#)
[Jeremy Dauber](#)
[Sitseeing](#)
[Jim Regan](#)
WEBLOGS
[Cook's Capitol](#)
[Commentary](#) > [Opinion](#)

from the October 27, 2004 edition

Let liberty transform Palestinians, too

By Scott Atran

GAZA CITY – In September, President Bush reasserted his commitment to the "road map" for Middle East peace, launched in 2003 to achieve a comprehensive Israeli-Palestinian agreement by 2005. He called on Palestinians to renounce terrorism, implicitly urged world leaders to cut ties to Yasser Arafat, and appealed to Israel to end "the daily humiliation" of Palestinians. He framed his remarks within an overall appeal for democracy in the Arab world, citing Iraq as a model of the "transformational power of liberty." In fact, for more than a year the US disastrously ignored Grand Ayatollah Ali al-Sistani's pleas to set up elections. Real democracy is the willingness to accept results we may not like.

US policy on a future Palestinian state is just as shortsighted. Israelis and Palestinians who have met with the National Security Council and State Department have come away certain that it is unofficial, but rock-solid, US policy to support Israel's stance that there can be no elections in the West Bank and Gaza as long as Mr. Arafat seems likely to be reelected.

A recent poll by the Palestinian Center for Policy and Survey Research found 54 percent of the 1,300 adults surveyed would vote for Arafat as president again. But the center's polls also suggest that Arafat would be politically weakened, because voters would replace older leaders in the legislative assembly with a younger majority that supports curtailing presidential powers. The center's director, Khalil Shikaki, has warned that without a democratic outlet, Palestinians may fall into civil war and militants will continue attacking Israel to maintain political prominence. That was also the message I

Related stories:

03/24/04

[Hamis vows defiance, as it picks new leader](#)

09/11/03

[Palestinian leader enters bitter fray](#)

09/08/03

[Why road map was left behind](#)

08/19/03

[Palestinian legislators set sights on new](#)
ADVERTISEMENT
Education
[Reference Articles](#)
[Research Articles](#)
Financial
[Car Insurance](#)
Gifts
[Send Flowers](#)
[Italian Charms](#)
[Gift Baskets](#)
[Italian Charms Sale!](#)
Music
[Latest Hit Lyrics](#)
Real Estate
[Moving](#)
[Moving Companies](#)
[Mortgage](#)
[Mortgage Calculator](#)
[Real Estate](#)
Travel
[Hotels](#)
[Hotel Reviews](#)
SUPPORT THE MONITOR

[Dave Cook](#)

[In Focus](#)

[John Nordell](#)

[The Index](#)

[Alan Messmer](#)

[Liblog](#)

[Monitor library staff](#)

[My American Life](#)

[Tom Regan](#)

[Notebook: Africa](#)

[Monitor correspondents](#)

[Notebook: Iraq](#)

[Monitor correspondents](#)

[The Poetic Life](#)

[Elizabeth Lund](#)

[SciTechblog](#)

[csmmonitor.com staff](#)

[Verbal Energy](#)

[Ruth Walker](#)

[We're Just Fans](#)

[csmmonitor.com staff](#)

Commentary Stories:
for 11/12/2004

[US Can Pick Up Arafat's
Dream](#)

[Gambling as a House of
Cards](#)

[Arafat leaves a troubled
legacy but no doubt that
there is a Palestinian
people](#)

[Signs of US-Iran
warming?](#)

[Letters to the Editor](#)

.....

[XML](#) [What is this?](#)

Most-viewed stories:
(for 11/12/04)

11/12/04
[New rebel tactics emerge
in Fallujah](#)

11/12/04
[CIA agent publicly chides
White House for terror
war](#)

11/12/04
[Pessimists will have to
wait, as housing boom
rolls on](#)

11/12/04

took away from interviews with senior Israeli counterterrorism strategists, Palestinian leaders, would-be suicide bombers, and the families of suicide "martyrs."

Life in the occupied territories has never been as bad. Northern Gaza is a charred battlefield and almost every West Bank town is ringed by guns, barbed wire, and concrete. The economy is lifeless, except for Ramallah, seat of the Palestinian Authority's dysfunctional ministries - and the NGOs that bring some activity. Palestinians are convinced that Israeli army checkpoints - where people often wait for hours in shadeless no man's lands or long tunnels - are meant to break their will and drive them from the land. Israelis counter that they nab, on average, at least one suicide bomber a day at the checkpoints and that Palestinians confuse cause - suicide bombing - with effect - extreme vigilance to stop it.

The possibility of elections is the one sliver of hope many Palestinians cling to. This is exactly the sort of "peaceful means to achieve the rights of their people, and create the reformed institutions of a stable democracy" that President Bush touts as the only way to achieve peace. But instead of helping Palestinians prepare for elections, the US supports Israel's policy of assassinating Hamas leaders, isolating Arafat, and blocking elections.

On one level, the iron-fist policy is working. Data on suicide attacks collected by one of Israel's top military strategists, Gen. Isaac Ben Israel, reveals that Hamas operations have been severely disrupted, reducing suicide attacks to pre-intifada levels. He sees this creating a "window" to negotiate with moderate Palestinians who represent the majority's wish to have a Palestinian state alongside Israel. But with no popular and viable alternative to Arafat on the horizon, and no elections to let the Palestinians develop one, there is only a wall in front of the window. Like pounding mercury with a hammer, military responses alone breed only more decentralized, and less containable, forms of terrorism.

Many earnest middle-class students at Al-Najah University in Nablus - who provide more suicide bombers than any other demographic group in the country - agree that "martyrs give us dignity to free ourselves." Their attitudes underscore social science research showing that the best predictors of popular support for suicide attacks are lack of civil liberties and the unresponsiveness of one's own government.

In Gaza's Jabaliyah refugee camp, I interviewed the family of Nabeel Masood, the 16-year-old from Al Aqsa Martyrs Brigades who exploded himself in Ashdod last April. Nabeel's mother was reading a letter from his school when I walked in the door. "Mr. and Mrs. Masood, it gives me great pleasure to inform you that your son Martyr Babeel [sic], has passed his tests successfully in the 11th grade. He

[elections](#)

E-mail newsletters

Get all of today's headlines, or alerts on specific topics.

[Subscribe for free.](#)



[Write a letter to the Editor](#)



[Printer-friendly version](#)



[Permission to reprint/republish](#)



→ [Help the Monitor.](#)

Donate now to support independent journalism.

MONITOR ARCHIVE

[Purchase articles](#) for as little as 15 cents each.

TREELESS EDITION®

New! [Subscribe](#) to the Treeless Edition!

SUBSCRIBE

→ [Free sample issue](#)

E-mail Alerts

→ [Environment](#)

→ [Travel](#)

→ [Ethics](#)

→ [More topics...](#)

Sign up now:



ADVERTISEMENT

Travel

[Hotels in UK & Europe](#)

[Discount Travel](#)

[Vacation Rentals](#)

[Hotel Savings](#)

[Event Tickets](#)

[Hotels](#)

[Hotel Deals](#)

[Travel](#)

[Guide to Hotels](#)

[More Hotels](#)

[Vacation Packages](#)

[A more moderate voice as](#)

[AG](#)

11/09/04

[James Carville, Bob Shrum, and Stan Greenberg](#)

was first in his class. He was distinguished not only in his hard studying, sharing, and caring, but also in his good morals and manhood. I would really like to congratulate you for his unique success in both life and the hereafter. You should be proud of your son's martyrdom."

I asked his father, "Do you think your son's sacrifice will make things better?"

"No," he said, "this hasn't brought us even one step forward." He went on: "There must be two states, one for us and one for the Israelis. We love Arafat but we must elect new people now to do it, before we are all dead."

But for now, they can elect no one. The democratic right that the Israeli Knesset displayed Tuesday over the Gaza pullout, and that Americans will exercise in November, is denied to the Palestinians, a people for whom "the transformational power of liberty" is truly a matter of life or death.

• *Scott Atran, a research scientist at the National Center for Scientific Research in Paris and the University of Michigan, is author of 'In Gods We Trust: The Evolutionary Landscape of Religion.'*

[Help the Monitor. Donate now to support independent journalism.](#)

Editor's picks

- [Slideshow: The fight for Fallujah](#) 
- [Re-run the presidential campaign. Can you change the outcome?](#)
- [In Travel: Art tour de France](#)

Most-read stories (for October):

- ['American' voice on new terror video](#) (10/29)
- [United's pension woes: sign of bigger issue](#) (10/04)
- [The prison that Martha Stewart will call home](#) (10/08)



[Write a letter to the Editor](#)



[Printer-friendly version](#)



[Permission to reprint/republish](#)

[back to top](#)

Business Resources

[Web Hosting Directory](#)
[Southwick Vescor](#)

Education

[Trade Schools Directory](#)

Shopping

[Buy & Sell Worldwide](#)